

1 THE BALTIMORE CITY BOARD OF SCHOOL COMMISSIONERS

2 BALTIMORE CITY PUBLIC SCHOOLS

3

4

5 PUBLIC BOARD MEETING

6

7 200 NORTH AVENUE

8

9 BALTIMORE, MARYLAND 21202

10

11 OCTOBER 27, 2015

12

13 6:00 P.M.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20 REPORTED BY:

21 W. BODENSTEIN

- 1 BOARD MEMBERS:
- 2
- 3 MARNELL COOPER, BOARD CHAIR
- 4 DR. GREGORY THORNTON, CEO
- 5 MARTHA JAMES-HASSAN
- 6 CHERYL CASCIANI
- 7 TINA HIKE-HUBBARD
- 8 LISA AKCHIN
- 9 PETER KANNAM
- 10 LINDA CHINNIA
- 11 JOHNATHAN TOWNES, STUDENT COMMISSIONER
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21

1	I N D E X	
2	Call to Order4
3	Color Guard Presentation.4
4	Moment of Silence6
5	Approval of Consent Agenda.6
6	CEO Comments.6
7	Gifts/Donations9
8	Public Comment.9
9	James Williams, Sr.9
10	Erica Bachman	15
11	Kim Trueheart	23
12	Kalman Hettleman.	27
13	External Audit Presentation	42
14	Information and Discussion.	53
15	2015 High School Results.	53
16	Upcoming Meetings	72
17	Close of Meeting.	73
18		
19		
20		
21		

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Good evening,
3 everyone. Welcome to the meeting for the
4 Baltimore City Board of School Commissioners.
5 Can I have a motion to open the meeting?

6 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: So moved.

7 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Motion by
8 Commissioner Hike-Hubbard. Second?

9 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: Second.

10 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Second by
11 Commissioner Casciani. All those in favor, raise
12 your hands? Eight in favor.

13 At this time, I'd like to have the call
14 to order and presentation of colors by New Era
15 Academy.

16 (Color Guard Presentation - New Era Academy)

17 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: (Applause.) JROTC
18 New Era Academy, London Turner, Maya Hamlet,
19 Shadea Stalworth, Nikia Forney and Josh Tyam.
20 For the pre-meeting musical selections as well as
21 the National Anthem, the performers are from

1 Rosemont Elementary School. Krystal Felician,
2 Denetta Robinson, Malea Starks, Shawn Stovall and
3 their Director is Mr. Samuel Leonard. Thank you
4 very much. (Applause.)

5 At this time, I'd like to take the time
6 to recognize the passing of a city schools'
7 student. We send our deepest condolences to his
8 family and friends. The student is Jeffrey
9 Wilson. He was an 11th grader at CASA Knowledge
10 and Success Academy.

11 Jeffrey started at CASA as a 6th grader
12 and he has been a CASA student for his entire
13 secondary career. He was pleasant, well liked by
14 his teachers and peers and generally a positive
15 young man. His parents were extremely involved
16 and supported of Jeffrey and all of the other
17 students at CASA as well.

18 Jeffrey started school this year looking
19 forward to becoming a senior. His passing has
20 been a tremendous shock to staff and students.
21 Funeral services took place on Friday, October

1 23rd at the Vaughn L. Green Funeral Home. I'd
2 like to have a moment of silence in memory of
3 Jeffrey Wilson.

4
5 (Moment of silence.)

6
7 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you. At this
8 time, I'd like to have a motion to approve the
9 Consent Agenda of action items.

10 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: So moved.

11 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: So moved by
12 Commissioner Hike-Hubbard. Second?

13 COMMISSIONER AKCHIN: Second.

14 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Second by
15 Commissioner Akchin. All those in favor, please
16 raise your hands. Commissioners Hassan,
17 Casciani, Hike-Hubbard, Cooper, Kannam, Akchin
18 and Chinnia. Motion passes, 7-0.

19 I'm going to waive by Board Chair
20 comments and turn it over to the CEO.

21 DR. THORNTON: Thank you very much, Mr.

1 Chair. Just two brief announcements. On behalf
2 of the Board, we would like to extend our
3 gratitude for your participation in our strategic
4 plan, Excellence and Equity, 2020. We've had
5 several meetings so far and I'm really pleased to
6 say the community has been deeply involved in the
7 process and we'd like to extend a warm invitation
8 to you for tomorrow night at Frederick Douglass
9 High School, and Thursday at Benjamin Franklin
10 High School to come out and have your voices
11 heard as we shape the direction of the system for
12 the next several years.

13 We truly want to hear from staff, we want
14 to hear from community and we have a special
15 stakeholder group set aside for our young people
16 because their voice is important as we make these
17 big decisions in the direction of hopefully
18 getting to excellence and equity for our young
19 people.

20 I will share with you that this is
21 College Awareness Month. Just a reminder, that's

1 a very special month for us. As we look forward,
2 one of the things I'm really pleased with, last
3 year, our number of applications for college
4 actually exceeded our all-time high, as well as
5 our \$60 million in scholarship dollars was
6 certainly a great support.

7 So, as we continue to move forward, I
8 would also ask you to realize that Friday is a
9 day for school. School is closed. We ask that
10 if you can make yourself available to be part of
11 the parent conferencing and going in to check and
12 see how our young people are doing and talk about
13 ways in which you can partner with our teachers
14 and principals and schools.

15 I'm looking at my notes here. It's next
16 month that is College Awareness. So, you have a
17 little time to get ready for it. But, it's a
18 really big point in time for us. As I move
19 around the district, I'm seeing more and more
20 college awareness and things in schools that
21 really signal to young people to the different

1 colleges available. There are also wonderful
2 opportunities in career and technical education
3 as well. That concludes my comments for the
4 night.

5 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Gifts and
6 donations. I want to acknowledge a \$5,000
7 donation to Franklin Square Elementary/Middle
8 School for the law exploration academic pathways,
9 critical literacy and forensic STEM program by
10 Verizon.

11 At this time, there's no public comment
12 on policy. I want to turn now to general public
13 comment. First up this evening is Mr. Kalman
14 Hettleman.

15 MR. HETTLEMAN: (Inaudible. Speaking
16 from audience.)

17 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: That's fine. We'll
18 go to the next one. Mr. James Williams, Sr.

19 MR. WILLIAMS: Good evening. I had a
20 meeting today concerning a policy that I brought
21 to your attention the last time I was here. I'm

1 going to be overseeing to make sure the policy
2 gets addressed, the promotion and retention
3 policy. So, I just met at 4:30 this evening with
4 a gentleman upstairs and hopefully that issue
5 will be resolved.

6 But, it brings another point as far as
7 your responsibilities as Board members. Policy
8 adherence and following thereof. It's your
9 responsibility to make sure policies are
10 followed. You can create them but, if you don't
11 make sure that they are followed, you're failing
12 in your jobs.

13 You guys don't get paid, I know that.
14 But, you do create the policies. So, you do have
15 a certain amount of responsibility when you do
16 that. That's your responsibility. Don't take it
17 lightly.

18 There are a lot of policies in the Board
19 documents that you need to really look at and
20 visit some schools and make sure that they are
21 being followed. If you don't, then you shouldn't

1 be here. You need to visit schools to see if
2 policies are being followed. Visit. Don't call.
3 Don't take somebody's word for it. Go. If you
4 can't spend time, I understand. You can't serve
5 two guards. If you've got bills and you've got a
6 job that you've got to go pay bills, I understand
7 that. But, you've got another job here and it's
8 extremely important because this involves our
9 future, our children. So, don't take this
10 lightly. Okay?

11 Since none of you guys get paid and Dr.
12 Thornton gets paid, that means the weight falls
13 on him because we pay for his job. That's what
14 my taxes pay for. Dr. Thornton.

15 I was going to bring you something today
16 from my farm. I'll make sure you get it today,
17 though. But, really and truthfully, I got a
18 meeting call today because I was coming to the
19 Board and it's interesting that when I'm coming
20 to speak to the Board, meetings pop up like that.

21 But, you mentioned something about

1 college readiness and the whole college thing. I
2 want people to understand, a lot of our students
3 aren't going to college and we don't have enough
4 slots in vocational schools like Carver and Mervo
5 and some of our zoned schools don't have any type
6 of programs for these kids.

7 There are apprenticeship programs in the
8 State of Maryland. We need to have
9 apprenticeship program information available at
10 all high schools. It's free because
11 apprenticeship programs, people who are in
12 apprenticeship programs, they get paid while
13 they're going. They can take money home. Every
14 child in high school should know that there are
15 apprenticeship programs that are free. They
16 don't incur any debt. This needs to be in all
17 high schools because we have a lot of kids that
18 actually don't know what they're going to do when
19 they graduate and they can't go to college.

20 So, thank you for the opportunity and
21 please remember, visit schools and make sure

1 these policies get addressed. I'm going to be
2 following up on more of them.

3 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Mr. Williams, do
4 you mind if I share something with you?

5 MR. WILLIAMS: Sure.

6 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you for your
7 comments. You're exactly right about the policy
8 issue. This Board, for a number of years, has
9 not had a policy committee. Meaning where the
10 Board reviews and addresses the policies that it
11 has either implemented or need to create.

12 As a result of that, this Board has
13 created a policy committee which met for the
14 first time earlier this week. Yesterday. Their
15 job is to do exactly what you just articulated to
16 us. So, we understand your point and I want to
17 let you know that we are already on it.

18 MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: If I could
20 just add to that quickly. The next policy
21 committee meeting is November 11th from 4:00 to

1 6:00 here in this room. So, if you want to come
2 and observe and if you have comments, you can
3 forward them ahead of time. It's November 11th
4 from 4:00 to 6:00 in this room. We are looking
5 at compliance of policies as well, not just what
6 needs to be addressed.

7 DR. THORNTON: I would only add, and
8 welcome your input, I think we're doing okay.
9 Just okay around apprenticeships. It's not
10 enough. The demand is a lot larger, as you just
11 shared, for these apprenticeships. So, if you
12 could help us and direct us and connect us, I
13 would be very open to that.

14 Some of the work we're doing is with BGE
15 and some other national groups. But, I will tell
16 you, our kids want to work. Some of them want to
17 work with their hands, some of them want to do
18 things differently.

19 So, as we think moving forward, we're
20 thinking in terms of whether a kid goes on to
21 college or whether they go on to a credentialed

1 career, it's going to take opportunities such as
2 apprenticeships. If you get a moment this
3 evening, I would love for you to jot down some
4 folks we can talk to. But, I need them to be
5 paid.

6 MR. WILLIAMS: Believe me, I wouldn't
7 mention it because people need, the
8 apprenticeship programs pay people while they're
9 learning and it's through the Department of
10 Labor, Licensing and Regulation and I'll give you
11 that number.

12 All guidance counselors can call and
13 they'll send a packet with the listing of
14 apprenticeship programs that the state has.
15 Okay? Thank you.

16 DR. THORNTON: Thank you. Can you make
17 sure you get that to me?

18 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you. Next up
19 is Erica Brachman.

20 MS. BRACHMAN: Good evening. My name is
21 Erica Brachman and I'm the Executive Director and

1 founder of Southwest Baltimore Charter School.

2 Just to clarify any misconceptions you
3 may have about our school, our student body is 85
4 percent FARM, 95 percent African American and
5 about 15 percent special ed.

6 First, I want to start off for thanking
7 each of you for the hours upon hours of unpaid
8 service you give to our city. I sincerely
9 appreciate the work, I just see the bags under
10 all of our eyes, that you do on behalf of
11 Baltimore's students.

12 I sit at this table, as I often have over
13 the last decade, as a partner. I don't think any
14 of you doubt the commitment those of us involved
15 in the charter movement have to this district. I
16 don't doubt your commitment. We all want to be
17 part of the solution.

18 But, despite all of our good intentions,
19 look at where we are. We shouldn't be surprised,
20 I suppose. Charter leaders have reached out
21 repeatedly over the years to express concern

1 about the system's decision to ignore the charter
2 law and the charter funding formula.

3 We have asked again and again for the
4 numbers behind the numbers, the justifications,
5 the assumptions, the policies. We have met with
6 Dr. Thornton and his staff in several visioning
7 sessions that resulted in little more than the
8 definition of the word innovation.

9 So, a lot has led us to where we are. At
10 this point, I just hope that you wield the power
11 that only you have to take control of this
12 situation and find a solution. We need a fair,
13 equitable, legal, reliable, transparent funding
14 formula.

15 It's hard to know what you, as School
16 Board members, know and when you know it. For
17 example, while we are so grateful to you for
18 pulling the proposed funding formula, it is not
19 clear to me if you ever saw the actual financial
20 impact that proposed funding formula would have
21 had on my school. It's not clear to me if you

1 were privy to the communication between Mayor
2 Schmoke, our lawyer and your lawyers before Mayor
3 Schmoke withdrew himself from the process. It's
4 not clear to me if you endorse the letters from
5 the school system that go out to our entire
6 school community repeating false information and
7 fanning the flames of an us versus them
8 mentality.

9 It's not clear to me if your legal team
10 is keeping you apprised of and you're approving
11 of their legal strategy. In a nutshell, I don't
12 know how macro or micro your involvement is in
13 these matters. But, no matter how in the weeds
14 you are or you aren't, at the end of the day,
15 unfortunately, this situation has unfolded on
16 your watch.

17 I urge you to reach out to those people
18 who can shed light on the facts. You may not
19 know that, contrary to many assertions some folks
20 keep making, the charter litigants are not
21 suggesting that significant items, like funding

1 for retiree health benefits or funding for
2 non-public placement of special education
3 students, should be distributed to charter
4 schools. We have never advocated for that and we
5 aren't suing for it, either.

6 I hope you agree that charters are good
7 for the system. I think you do. I think you
8 think they're good for kids and families and good
9 for Baltimore. It appears to those of us on the
10 outside, however, that you may be unwittingly
11 endorsing a plan of action that is increasingly
12 damaging to all of our schools, including charter
13 schools.

14 Surely you believe that it would be good
15 for all of our students if we could determine a
16 funding formula that is fair, transparent,
17 sustainable and legal. Only you hold the power
18 to make that happen. Thank you.

19 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you. We have
20 a question.

21 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: It's just more

1 of a comment. Just for a point of clarification,
2 you're right, we do care. The Board did choose
3 to decide to get into the weeds. We got really
4 deep in the weeds. Spent a lot of time in the
5 spring in the weeds and did look at the numbers
6 and did understand the implications of those
7 numbers. We scheduled a meeting to discuss it so
8 that we could say we don't think this works.
9 This is probably not the right way to go.

10 We learned. We saw the letter that the
11 Charter Coalition advised all its members not to
12 attend that meeting. So, the Board members on
13 that committee were prepared to sit and talk. I
14 had it on my calendar. I can show you the little
15 vacant space that now exists. Had anybody come
16 to that meeting, we would have had a chance to
17 talk and understand that we did not think that
18 that was the formula.

19 So, now here we are all these months
20 later and we are paying a price for it. But, we
21 did get into the weeds. We did get into the

1 implications and we agree. But, we did not agree
2 that somebody should have advised all of their
3 members to not attend the meeting with the School
4 Board members to talk about it.

5 I just want to put a clarifying point out
6 there on that. Yes, we did know what it meant
7 and we thought that you would think the same
8 thing that we thought which was this isn't the
9 right numbers. But, we never had a chance to say
10 it. And the next thing you know, the next letter
11 we got was a lawsuit.

12 MS. BRACHMAN: Well, I do want to
13 clarify something there. I want to make sure the
14 Board understands that the lawsuit was not a
15 reaction to the funding formula. That lawsuit
16 was not put together in a week.

17 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: We understand
18 that. I'm only responding to, yes. We
19 understand that.

20 MS. BRACHMAN: I appreciate you,
21 individually, and each of you for the work that

1 you're doing. There is a long history here of
2 distrust, misrepresentations, failed
3 communications. So, while that one meeting feels
4 very important to some people involved in this
5 matter, there are other meetings that felt very
6 important to others of us. I think that that has
7 just been the pattern of communication over time.

8 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: Erica, yes,
9 that's right. I have acknowledged to my fellow
10 Board members how naive it was of me to place too
11 much weight on that meeting and I'm confident
12 that somebody is going to say I should not have
13 said this in public. I'm sorry about that.

14 MS. BRACHMAN: Me too. I should
15 probably shut my mouth, too. But, it's hard
16 because we all really care about this.

17 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: But, when you
18 ask repeatedly, collectively, for the Board to
19 pay attention, for the Board to get involved, for
20 the Board to be transparent, and then we try and
21 somebody says do not meet with them. Well, that

1 was a message to us as well.

2 MS. BRACHMAN: Well, here we are. We're
3 in this moment in time and we all need to move
4 forward. So, I guess my point is that, at this
5 point, the Board holds the power here. As I
6 said, it's not clear -

7 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: That's not true.
8 That's not true at this point.

9 VOICE: (Inaudible. Discussion off the
10 record.)

11 MS. BRACHMAN: I should probably stop
12 talking too. Thank you.

13 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Next is Ms. Kim
14 Trueheart.

15 MS. TRUEHEART: Three minutes is not
16 enough. Good evening. Yeah, who has the power?
17 The parents and citizens of this city have the
18 power. They've asked that this Board serve in a
19 role to serve 85,000 children. Not 14,000. And,
20 ensure that all 85,000 get a great education.

21 Right now, there is so much to be fixed

1 in terms of the inequities in the funding and I
2 am absolutely offended that the charters have
3 decided to go to court and sue for 14 percent of
4 the students.

5 If they really were concerned about the
6 85,000 children in this system, they would have
7 come to the neighborhood schools and said let's
8 partner. Let's fix the system collectively.
9 But, they didn't choose to do that.

10 So, when they talk about how they want to
11 extort money through a lawsuit to get what they
12 want, it pisses me off. It pisses me off
13 royally. Until they learn that they need to work
14 collaboratively with the entirety of the system,
15 you all need to reject everything they do.
16 Everything they put in front of you. I know this
17 sounds harsh, but I'm pissed. I'm pissed because
18 85,000 children deserve a great education in
19 great schools with great teachers and they're not
20 getting it now. For them to think that they
21 should come first, because that's what this says.

1 They think they should come first and that is
2 outrageous. It is absolutely outrageous and
3 anybody that wants to talk to me about it, I'm
4 here every other Tuesday.

5 So, as far as I'm concerned, this
6 conversation is about our children and not about
7 prima donna-like folks who think that they have
8 first say in this conversation.

9 I visited a school last Monday, Baltimore
10 Community High School. When is that place going
11 to be shut down? I talked to the Councilman in
12 that district and he said it will close at the
13 end of the school year. I'd like confirmation of
14 that. That place is obnoxiously bad.

15 DR. THORNTON: Ms. Trueheart, a
16 recommendation will be made to the Board and
17 pending the outcome of that recommendation,
18 you'll have an answer. I'm not prepared to -

19 MS. TRUEHEART: I'm endorsing that
20 recommendation at this moment if it means that
21 place will close.

1 DR. THORNTON: Well, thank you. You're
2 assuming -

3 MS. TRUEHEART: If it means that place
4 will close, then I am endorsing it right now.

5 DR. THORNTON: November 10th is the
6 meeting.

7 MS. TRUEHEART: Thank you so much. So,
8 by the end of the year, we will have a Christmas
9 package to wrap around that building and throw
10 away the key or something.

11 Then, I visited on Friday, your eMaps.
12 Is that what it's called? Elementary/Middle
13 Alternative Programs. Awesome program to get
14 disengaged kids back on track.

15 I have a 16-year old that I'm now
16 responsible for which is a scary thought. This
17 young man needs to get re-engaged and what I
18 heard on Friday, and I want to commend the staff
19 there, the principal, everybody. The attendance
20 coordinator, the guidance counselor, everyone
21 there extended an invitation to me and this young

1 man that they were going to be committed to him.
2 That's the most impressive thing I've seen in
3 this system in a while. If we could replicate
4 that because there are more kids out there.

5 This is a homeless child that I'm talking
6 about. We need to extend very great
7 opportunities like that to him. Thank you.

8 DR. THORNTON: Thank you for the
9 message. Thank you.

10 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Mr. Hettleman?

11 MR. HETTLEMAN: Thank you for deferring.
12 Good evening, Commissioners, Dr. Thornton. With
13 me is Imani Rose, a parent of a child with
14 disabilities. In the audience is Pat Hallie from
15 the Maryland Disability Law Center. We are all
16 Board members of the Citywide Coalition. But, we
17 speak tonight as individuals because we have not
18 had time for the process for the approval of the
19 statement by the full membership.

20 To summarize, there has been a steady
21 decline in efforts to improve special education

1 that cries out for Board policy oversight. Here
2 is some of the evidence of the system's decline
3 and dysfunction.

4 There has been a failure to follow
5 through on implementation of the nationally
6 acclaimed One Year Plus policy. The formal
7 monitoring system was dismantled. There have
8 been repeated broken promises to improve
9 instructional services and to take other steps to
10 improve implementation.

11 There has been a lack of clarity and
12 coherence under the administrative
13 reorganization. There is much confusion and the
14 504 and SST programs remain separate from special
15 education, causing harm to students and families.

16 There has been the apparent withholding
17 of a major internal report written last year by
18 the Special Education Academic Director that
19 cited severe weaknesses in instruction and
20 support for teachers.

21 There has been a lack of planning. The

1 strategic plan says virtually nothing about
2 special education. We've received a list of
3 initiatives but there is not any operational
4 details as to who is going to do what and when.

5 There has been a refusal to review the
6 dysfunctionality of the position of IEP Chair,
7 people inside and outside the system recognize
8 this but it simply has not been addressed and
9 there has been a downgrade in transition
10 services.

11 All told, there is an attempt to use
12 reorganization as an excuse to reset the clock on
13 long-delayed and overdue actions. But, the clock
14 on children's development cannot be reset. The
15 harm to students with disabilities is
16 compounding.

17 Please convene a public meeting to review
18 this evidence. Also, please provide written
19 answers to the attached questions. We realize
20 the Board must rely on the staff for answers, but
21 you have the oversight responsibility to ask the

1 questions and to review the sufficiency of the
2 answers.

3 It is also of note that the Board has
4 lost its special education representative and its
5 former Chair, both of whom were particularly
6 interested, to the best of my knowledge, in
7 special education. It is now up to the Board to
8 step up its policy oversight in this area. Thank
9 you for your consideration of these urgent
10 concerns.

11 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you, Mr.
12 Hettleman. I have a question for you. Your
13 knowledge of the special education seat, of which
14 was filled by previous Commissioner, Dr. David
15 Stone, my question is our committee structure.
16 Which committee would this issue fall under?

17 MR. HETTLEMAN: Well, I think it should
18 fall under Teaching and Learning. If you look at
19 the schedule of the meetings for this year, I
20 think there are periodic dates for report on
21 special education. But, obviously, it's at the

1 end of the line and it has not been assessed as a
2 priority. I haven't heard anybody say anything.

3 So, unfortunately, it seems to get
4 secondary consideration. These problems are
5 getting rapidly worse. Yes, they weren't created
6 overnight and there are not easy answers. But,
7 we are sliding. We were making some progress and
8 now we're going backwards.

9 I think, for this particular population,
10 I know you care about all the children, but for
11 this particular population, I would think it
12 would be regarded with alarm. I hope that you
13 will, perhaps Teaching and Learning could chair a
14 special committee meeting on this and staff could
15 provide answers to the questions and hopefully
16 you will review the answers.

17 Once again, I try to be very specific.
18 These are well documented issues and there are
19 long papers trails of the system's unwillingness
20 or inability to address these issues.

21 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Commissioner

1 Hike-Hubbard?

2 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: In Teaching
3 and Learning, we're supposed to have quarterly
4 conversations and special ed. If it's not on the
5 calendar, it needs to be worked in there. I
6 agree that we need to have updates on One Year
7 Plus, etc. We need to have actual general data
8 on implementation of special ed across the board.

9 So, while it may not be that we address
10 every single question you have on this list, Mr.
11 Hettleman, but I do think there are things in
12 here, like where we are with One Year Plus, and
13 things of that nature, data around special ed,
14 where we are and what we're doing, is part of
15 Teaching and Learning and should be coming up in
16 our meetings. So, if it's not on the calendar,
17 Peter, I would ask that you look at the calendar
18 and make sure it's there. We agreed last year in
19 Teaching and Learning that we would not have a
20 separate special ed committee but that we would
21 have it publicly incorporated into the Teaching

1 and Learning committee meetings quarterly.

2 COMMISSIONER KANNAM: Yes, thanks,
3 Commissioner Hike-Hubbard. Yes, thank you,
4 Buzzy, for coming and sharing. It's part of the
5 Teaching and Learning committee calendar. We'll
6 make sure we address it at that time.

7 MR. HETTLEMAN: I appreciate that and I
8 know everyone is overloaded and trying hard.
9 But, to say that you will address it in January
10 is not, to me, a sufficient response. I'm sorry
11 to say that but I'm an advocate for the children.

12 When I was on the School Board, first, we
13 had a special education committee as well as a
14 curriculum instruction committee. I think you
15 need to revive that. I think you have an
16 obligation to these children, given what is going
17 on, to take some action.

18 So, the other thing is, I don't know the
19 current practice. When I was on the Board, if
20 there were written questions, the Board provided
21 written answers. So, I ask that you provide, and

1 obviously staff is going to provide the answers
2 to you. I know you don't know the answers. But,
3 there has to be an accountable process where you
4 just don't listen to generalized things and then
5 they go away.

6 So, I ask, will you provide written
7 answers to these questions in a timely way so
8 that they can be discussed? If you think the
9 issues aren't clear or you think they're
10 unreasonable, we're open to that. We want to be
11 collaborative in this process. I've offered the
12 same thing to staff many times.

13 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: I will defer that
14 to the Chair of the Teaching and Learning
15 committee with respect to responses. He and his
16 committee can address that issue at your next
17 meeting or however you guys decide to do that.

18 With respect to the questions, Peter,
19 I'll let you handle that. Commissioner Casciani?

20 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: Thanks, Buzzy.
21 I didn't have a chance to read very single word

1 of this. But, I flipped to the back page of what
2 you just handed us, the part about findings from
3 the Student Center Coaching Model Report.
4 There's something in here that quickly caught my
5 eye.

6 It sounds like he used to be in the
7 system. I apologize, I don't know Mr. Layton.
8 He did a report after extensive interviews and
9 the One Year Plus Advisory Panel has asked for
10 copies of the report. You were told by somebody,
11 it's an unnamed "we", were told by someone that
12 the report was not available. But then, in the
13 next paragraph, it says that he did provide the
14 report to the Office of Special Education. So,
15 which is it? Is there a report or is there not a
16 report?

17 MR. HETTLEMAN: All we know, and maybe
18 staff, we have asked several times for this
19 report. I was actively involved last year. We
20 had meetings around the report.

21 Matt Layton, who left the system in June,

1 was a star. He was the academic specialist, or
2 whatever it was called, for the Office of Special
3 Education. He did this year-long project. He
4 has said that he left a report but all that we
5 were sent were these findings by email. We've
6 asked repeatedly for the report. We've been told
7 that, at least I believe, and Ms. Chen will
8 correct me if I'm wrong, I believe Ms. Chen and
9 Ms. Clemons have said they don't have the report.
10 When we asked the questions. You may have it now
11 because Ms. Crawford sent it in. She emailed it
12 to you.

13 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: Just this list.

14 MR. HETTLEMAN: Yes, correct. Mr.
15 Layton told Ms. Crawford that he handed in the
16 list to Dr. Hoffman. We relayed several times,
17 to ask Dr. Hoffman. We never got any answer. It
18 just was an attempt.

19 These are very significant and sad
20 findings.

21 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: I'm raising it

1 because I think we should find out about the
2 report. The second thing is my knowledge of
3 special ed content, as you know, is not deep.
4 Pat can verify this. She's schooled me for
5 years. I try to keep up but I never pretend to
6 be smart.

7 But, even I remember, as a non-Board
8 member, when we got out of court, a collective
9 cheer went up through the city. We made a big
10 deal at the time that One Year Plus was an
11 innovation and something that was nice, not only
12 were we out of court but we were advancing.

13 MR. HETTLEMAN: We raised the bar.

14 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: Raising the bar.
15 So, even if we only have, whoever is going to be
16 given this list of questions, question number one
17 on this list is One Year Plus implementation. I
18 really think the Board does need to understand.
19 It was a big deal when we got out of court on
20 that initiative. I think you called it policy,
21 I'm not sure if it was a policy, an initiative,

1 whatever it was, we should know more about where
2 that is. Whether it's Teaching and Learning,
3 because those are not public meetings. Whether
4 it's before the Board.

5 MR. HETTLEMAN: Teaching and Learning
6 are public meetings, there's just no public
7 input. Although we've asked for that.

8 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Taking our time.
9 It's coming.

10 MR. HETTLEMAN: The clock runs fast on
11 the children, Chairman.

12 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Commissioner
13 Hike-Hubbard.

14 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: I agree that
15 some of these things should come up in Teaching
16 and Learning because they are theoretical, where
17 should we go, conversations.

18 I think the Board and the Commission
19 deserves a response on where we are with One Year
20 Plus. I'd like to have staff respond to that
21 because in Teaching and Learning, I need

1 something to respond to in that conversation.
2 So, having a pre-thought out response on One Year
3 Plus and where we are. If this Layton report
4 exists, I'd love to see that report myself. Our
5 quarterly progress reports on IEP progress, that
6 should be public knowledge as well. It's
7 producing information for the district. So, why
8 can't we have that information provided by staff
9 ahead of time in preparation for Teaching and
10 Learning, and then we can get to the more
11 theoretical questions around how we implement
12 IEP/SST programs, etc.

13 So, I'd like to see some of the staff
14 response to the beginning questions which are
15 really just about giving background data and
16 information.

17 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you, Mr.
18 Hettleman. Commissioner Hassan?

19 COMMISSIONER HASSAN: Another added
20 point is, again, with the policy committee. The
21 policy committee could take a look at the One

1 Year Plus policy and ensure that it is a policy
2 and that we are in compliance.

3 MR. HETTLEMAN: It is not a policy.

4 (Transition in audio. Some dialogue
5 lost.)

6 COMMISSIONER HASSAN: And then, the
7 second piece is in the absence of Dr. Stone, I've
8 become sort of the default special ed person, as
9 a person who has taught special education for
10 several years and worked in compliance and
11 administration. So, I'm going to look into the
12 ethical piece but I would offer up to be in
13 attendance at the Advisory Coalition meetings to
14 hear directly, I would not be a voting member,
15 but could show up at those meetings and hear what
16 those concerns are to be able to bring them to my
17 colleagues on the Board in a more timely fashion.

18 MR. HETTLEMAN: To the credit of staff,
19 they have been cooperative in attending those
20 meetings. Of course, we have a new head of
21 special ed, in effect, which is set the process

1 back somewhat. But, again, that doesn't justify
2 resetting the clock.

3 The issue is, and we meet periodically
4 with this One Year Plus Advisory Panel. The
5 problem is that staff comes but the follow-up
6 isn't there. We're promised and it doesn't
7 happen. Again, there's all kinds of
8 documentation of this and I appreciate that you
9 are interested and are picking up on this. I
10 hope there will be an open, you know, you have
11 discussions on charters and facilities. Maybe it
12 would be good to have a head to head round table
13 on special education and hear these things out.
14 We would very much appreciate your responses this
15 evening.

16 COMMISSIONER HASSAN: Well, if I am
17 invited, I will attend.

18 MR. HETTLEMAN: You're invited.

19 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you very
20 much.

21 MR. HETTLEMAN: Thank you all very much.

1 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: I wanted to back
2 track to Board Chair Comments. I was not
3 supposed to waive my comments because there is an
4 external auditor presentation that was supposed
5 to take place. Clifton Larson, I see you guys
6 back there. Can you come up to the table,
7 please?

8 MR. NOVAK: Good evening. My name is
9 Keith Novak. I'm a principal with Clifton,
10 Larson, Allen. We were the auditors for the city
11 school system this year. With me is Airus
12 Coleman, one of our engagement directors who
13 oversaw the process.

14 What we'd like to do tonight is spend a
15 few minutes going over the audit, going over our
16 approach, talking about pension liability
17 discouragers because they're new this year.
18 We'll go over the results, certain communications
19 and then go over some things that are coming up.

20 I'm not going to monopolize the
21 presentation. I'll go over a few things and then

1 turn it over to Airus to let her go over the
2 communications and some other things.

3 The first thing, the project was led by
4 Clifton, Larson, Allen. However, we were
5 assisted by King and King and Phillips and
6 Company who were our business enterprise partners
7 on the engagement.

8 When we work with partners, we integrate
9 their auditors into our audit team so that's a
10 seamless process. Our audit approach was
11 risk-based with an emphasis on the assessment of
12 key internal controls. Throughout the process,
13 we had communications that were frequent,
14 including formal status meetings and
15 informational communications between us and
16 management, as well as others.

17 This year, there was one change in the
18 financial statements that, for most every other
19 entity in the state, was relatively significant.
20 For the city school system, it's only a
21 disclosure. That had to do with pensions.

1 The requirement for pensions at this
2 point in time was for pension liability to be
3 recorded on the balance sheet of the school
4 system. However, because of special funding
5 situation arrangements that the school system
6 has, both the State of Maryland through the
7 teachers retirement system, as well as with
8 Baltimore City for management employees, the
9 liability is recorded either at the state level
10 or at the city level.

11 However, your financial statements do
12 disclose the amount of those liabilities.
13 However, they are not your responsibility, they
14 are someone else's responsibility.

15 With that, let me turn it over to Airus
16 so she can give you the results of the audit and
17 also go over certain communications.

18 MS. COLEMAN: Good evening. I wanted to
19 go over the audit results and required
20 communications that your auditors must
21 communicate with the Board.

1 First off, the audit results. We issued
2 an unmodified opinion, which is the highest
3 assurance that we can give over a set of
4 financial statements. What this means is that
5 all material aspects, city schools financial
6 statements were completed in accordance with
7 general accounting principles.

8 We also issued an internal control report
9 on financial reporting and on compliance in other
10 matters. We look at the internal controls over
11 the financial reporting process and we did not
12 identify any material weaknesses over that
13 process.

14 As I mentioned before, we are required to
15 communicate specific information to the Board.
16 So, I'll go over those items right now.

17 First, the auditors' responsibility for
18 the financial statements. The financial
19 statements are the responsibility of management.
20 We are hired to form an opinion over those
21 financial statements to state whether they are

1 performed and created in accordance with general
2 accounting principles.

3 For qualitative aspect over the
4 accounting practices, management is responsible
5 for the selection and use of appropriate
6 accounting policies. The significant accounting
7 policies are disclosed in the summary of
8 significant accounting policies in Note One in
9 the financial statements.

10 The preparation of the financial
11 statements require that certain estimates and
12 judgments be made by management. For the fiscal
13 year `15 financial statements for city schools,
14 these judgments and estimates included the GASB
15 68 Net Pension Liability Disclosures which Keith
16 discussed earlier, depreciable lines of capital
17 assets, claims, liabilities for incurred but not
18 reported claims for self-insurance and health
19 insurance, also known as IBNR, compensating
20 absence liability and your receivable allowance
21 for uncollectible receivables.

1 We concluded that management has a
2 reasonable basis for these significant judgment
3 estimates and their impact on the financial
4 statements. There were no sensitive financial
5 disclosures for this year.

6 Some other quick communications that we
7 are required to make. No significant
8 difficulties were encountered during the audit.
9 There were no disagreements with management on
10 financial, accounting and reporting matters,
11 auditing procedures or other matters. Management
12 did sign representation and took responsibility
13 for the financial statements.

14 We were informed by management that they
15 made no consultations on the application of
16 generally accepted accounting principles and
17 generally accepted auditing standards.

18 There were no significant issues
19 discussed with management prior to their
20 retention of us as their auditor. There were no
21 additional findings or issues previously

1 discussed. We do not express an opinion on
2 required supplemental information or supplemental
3 information which is provided in the financial
4 statements.

5 Lastly, Keith will go over upcoming GASBs
6 that may affect the city's financial statements
7 in the future.

8 MR. NOVAK: Yeah, one thing I did want
9 to add to that last comment of Airus's. With
10 regard to expressing or not expressing an opinion
11 on required supplemental information. While we
12 don't express an opinion, what we do is we read
13 it and we compare it to the financial statements
14 to make sure there are no inconsistencies, if you
15 will, between that information and the
16 information that had been audited.

17 The other thing I did want to mention is
18 we had mentioned the audit opinion was unmodified
19 and Airus did a good job of explaining the report
20 on internal controls in accordance with
21 government audit standards. This audit was

1 performed in accordance with government audit
2 standards which is a standard above the normal
3 standard for financial statement audits.

4 Whenever you're doing a governmental
5 audit, the likelihood is that you'll be held to
6 that standard. Also, because of the single audit
7 that the city has to undertake every year. It
8 becomes a requirement.

9 I just want to make you aware of a couple
10 things that are coming up in the next couple
11 years that will be included in the financial
12 statements. Next year in the financial
13 statements, we will have a disclosure of the fair
14 value measurements on investments and other
15 assets that are measured at fair value.

16 That's something that's been going on in
17 the private sector world for probably the last 10
18 or so years now. So, it will be a disclosure
19 that will be new to the school system. However,
20 anybody coming from the public sector who is used
21 to looking at public sector financial statements

1 will not find it to be strange.

2 Basically, what it is is a requirement
3 that we describe how fair value is arrived at and
4 then categorize investments based upon whether
5 there are readily available inputs or not readily
6 available inputs. Effectively, if I can look it
7 up in the Wall Street Journal and get a price on
8 it, then they're readily available. If I can't,
9 they're not readily available and there is a
10 category in the middle of it.

11 So, on the one end, I can work
12 (Inaudible. Unidentified coughing.) It. On the
13 other end, it's somebody's company that has to be
14 valued by evaluation specialists. But, that will
15 be a disclosure that will be in the statements.
16 We don't anticipate that that will have a
17 significant impact on the city school system's
18 financial statements.

19 The other one is statement number 75
20 having to do with other post-employment benefits.
21 That will be effective for the year ending June

1 30, 2018. It will not have an impact on your
2 financial statements, much like the pension
3 didn't have an impact because there are other
4 people, in particular, Baltimore City, who are
5 responsible for your other post-employment
6 benefits. However, there will be a disclosure
7 involved with that.

8 Lastly, one of the other items that we
9 are hired to perform an audit on is your federal
10 programs and that is a single audit which is
11 ongoing at this point in time. We will be
12 issuing that report probably sometime in December
13 which is when it normally is completed. As in
14 prior years, we don't anticipate any significant
15 issues or any findings with that.

16 Lastly, we had provided a management
17 letter on scenarios that we felt you could
18 improve upon operations and some controls. But,
19 they weren't upper level that rose to where we
20 include in the government audit standards letter.
21 With that, if you have any questions, we'd be

1 more than happy to try to answer them.

2 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Questions?
3 Commissioner Hike-Hubbard?

4 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: This might
5 be hard for you but in non-auditor speak, how did
6 we do?

7 MR. NOVAK: You did well. You did as
8 well as you can do, in non-auditor speak.

9 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: Thank you.
10 For the public, it's important to know. With all
11 the technical terms, I think it's important to
12 have an overall sense.

13 MR. NOVAK: The one thing about our
14 profession is we are somewhat pessimistic. We're
15 not allowed to put anything good in writing.
16 We're only allowed to put in writing things that
17 you can improve upon. So, that's why you don't
18 see things like that in writing. But, in regular
19 people speak, you did well.

20 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you, Mr.
21 Novak and Ms. Coleman.

1 MR. NOVAK: Certainly. Thank you.

2 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Next up for
3 information and discussion, item 7.01, 2015 High
4 School Results, summary data. Please introduce
5 yourselves.

6 MS. JONES: Good evening, everyone. My
7 name is Theresa Jones. I serve as our Chief
8 Achievement and Accountability Officer here at
9 city schools.

10 MR. HALL: Good evening. My name is
11 Shane Hall. I'm the Director of Research here at
12 city schools.

13 MS. CHEN: Linda Chen, Chief Academic
14 Officer.

15 MR. RUIZ: Rudy Ruiz, Executive Director
16 for College and Career Readiness.

17 MS. JONES: So, this evening we'd like
18 to share with you updated data points as it
19 relates to our high school results over the last
20 year. We have a number of data points that were
21 just recently released as of today. So, as it

1 related to the Class of 2014, we have updated
2 adjusted cohort rates for our graduation and
3 drop-out rates. We also have updates around our
4 HSA results. We'll share those as well.

5 We also have a number of other data
6 points that speak to college and career
7 readiness, SAT, PSAT and ACT performance. We'd
8 like to share those with you this evening as
9 well. I'd also like to point out that we will
10 have a further deep dive conversation around
11 these data points and how they relate to the
12 various strategies and plans that are in place at
13 the upcoming Teaching and Learning Committee
14 meeting on November 24. So, again, this is
15 intended, in part, to wet your whistle a little
16 bit. But, it will be something that we'll have
17 an opportunity to dig deeper on in the next few
18 weeks.

19 In terms of the highlights, in terms of
20 the Class of 2014, as most folks are aware, we
21 report out on four-year graduation rates, as well

1 as five-year graduation rates. The four-year
2 graduation and drop-out rates were reported
3 previously. Tonight's update will include a
4 comparison of the four-year and five-year rates.
5 The five-year rate will capture those students
6 that graduated in June of 2015.

7 In terms of the top line results, what
8 you'll notice is that there is an increase in
9 graduation rates and a decrease in the drop-out
10 rate for the Class of 2014. As we take a look at
11 our numbers, we have 74.9 percent of that cohort
12 that have graduated in a five-year time period.
13 We have 10.9 percent that dropped out. We have
14 another 10.7 percent that remain enrolled at the
15 end of that time period.

16 Take a look at slide four, this shows a
17 comparison of our four-year graduation versus our
18 five-year graduation data points. Again, you'll
19 notice there is an upward trend across both sets
20 of data points.

21 As it relates to the four-year graduation

1 rates versus the Class of 2013, we see an
2 increase of 1.2 points and we have a percentage
3 change, an increase of 1.8 percent. Over the
4 last four years, you'll notice that the increase
5 is actually 13.3 percent.

6 Comparing that to our five-year
7 graduates, what you'll see is a little bit of a
8 steeper uplift there. You'll see we have a 1.4
9 point change versus a year ago, 1.9 percent
10 difference. Then, over the course of the last
11 four years, a 12.3 percent as our overall
12 percentage change.

13 As you take a look at the number of
14 graduates, a couple key points here. You'll
15 notice that while those numbers are down, this is
16 partly a function of declining enrollment that
17 we've experienced at the high school level. What
18 you'll notice here is for our four-year
19 graduates, we have a decrease versus a year ago
20 of 6.4 percent. For our five-year graduates,
21 that number is 5.9 percent.

1 In terms of the drop-out rate, as
2 mentioned, the drop-out rate does continue to
3 decrease. If you take a look at where we are
4 versus four years ago, it's more than 50 percent
5 of a decrease. That number is 54.2, as noted
6 here, from 23.8 with the Class of 2010, versus
7 10.9 with our most recent Class of 2014. Versus
8 a year ago, that decline is not as great but it
9 is a decline of 0.9 percent.

10 In terms of looking at our drop-out data,
11 we do take a look at which year in school that
12 students actually drop out during the high school
13 years. So, you see here the comparison from
14 first year versus fourth year. Not surprisingly,
15 we typically see the highest drop-out activity
16 occur with our fourth year students. In this
17 case, looking at our data for the Class of 2014,
18 that number is up slightly versus where we were
19 the year before. As it relates to the other
20 groups, there is a slight increase in the second
21 year drop-out students as well, and declines in

1 both the first and third year.

2 We're going to switch gears a moment here
3 and talk about various measures of academic
4 achievement. In this conversation, we're going
5 to tag-team this a bit with our CAO's office to
6 talk about some of the activities that contribute
7 to these results.

8 First, in terms of looking at our HSA
9 results, what we're going to show you in the
10 upcoming slides are the actual graphic
11 representations of these different data points.
12 But, to top line them for you first, the
13 proportion of seniors that have passed all of
14 their HSA exams continues to increase. That's a
15 two percentage point increase versus the prior
16 year. As we take a look at seniors and how
17 they're actually graduating, we notice that while
18 there is a decline in those that graduated based
19 on the combined HSA score, we do see that there
20 were increases all HSA exam pass rate that I
21 mentioned, and also in terms of Bridge passing,

1 that rate is more or less flat.

2 In terms of AP results, we're going to
3 take a look at AP participation, take a look at
4 pass rates as well. The proportion of AP exams
5 passed by our students has increased. That is up
6 to nearly 29 percent, up from 27.3 percent in the
7 prior year. As we take a look at those students
8 who took at least one exam and had a passing
9 score, we're at 26.2 percent up from 23 percent
10 in the three years earlier.

11 As it relates to our PSAT, we're going to
12 take a look at both sophomore and junior PSAT
13 performance. The number of sophomore PSAT takers
14 remained relatively flat. However, the number of
15 junior PSAT takers has increased nearly 7
16 percent.

17 The other thing that you'll also note
18 here is that, on average, the scores on the PSAT
19 were slightly lower versus the prior year. But,
20 we'll talk about that in a bit.

21 Taking a look at our SAT, and this is

1 looking at results from our seniors that took the
2 SAT, what we note here is that there was a slight
3 increase versus 2013, despite the fact that
4 Maryland and the nation declined slightly. So,
5 here again, this is one of those points where
6 we're doing a little bit better in terms of our
7 increases, although we still have some work to do
8 in terms of the absolute performance on the SAT
9 as well on PAC momentarily.

10 As we take a look at the scores, we also
11 see some score increases which is positive and
12 good news for us. That's across all three groups
13 of subjects. So, looking at our average reading
14 scores increased, average writing scores
15 increased, and math scores increased.

16 Also, as you may know, there are tending
17 to be more students that are taking the ACT. So,
18 we're not just relying on SAT results to tell the
19 college and career readiness story. As we look
20 at our ACT performance, we found that both
21 participation and performance did increase versus

1 the prior year.

2 So, let's look at specific numbers. This
3 slide looks at our 12th grade students and how
4 well they satisfied the HSA requirements for
5 graduation. So, again, as noted before, we have
6 47.8 percent of those students that passed all of
7 their HSA requirements. Then, on the right side,
8 you'll see in terms of those who passed by
9 Bridge. We call that more or less flat. You'll
10 see that's 37 percent versus 36.5 in the prior
11 year. In terms of those who passed by the
12 combined HSA score, you'll notice that that
13 number is down to 15 percent.

14 As we take a look at specific subjects,
15 what you'll notice here is that of the three
16 subjects, the one where we did see a slight
17 increase was in the biology content area at 62.5
18 percent. Then, in terms of Algebra and English,
19 you'll notice those are both down slightly at
20 58.5 and 58.6 percent as the absolute numbers.

21 Switching gears to speak to our AP

1 results, first we're going to take a look at
2 where we are in terms of course enrollment and
3 exam participation. So, actually, I'll ask Rudy
4 if he wants to provide perspective around this
5 because you can speak to some of the efforts
6 we've taken around availability of AP courses,
7 etc.

8 MR. RUIZ: Right. So, essentially,
9 we're trying to provide more guidance to schools
10 and making sure that they're aware of what best
11 practices are around eliminating gate keeping and
12 making sure we have as open access as possible to
13 rigorous courses like advanced placement.

14 In terms of the enrollment numbers here,
15 although you see a slight decrease over the last
16 few years, I would call attention to the fact
17 that overall enrollment and cohort sizes in the
18 district matches pretty tightly to this. So, in
19 some ways, it's a reflection of our slight
20 decline in overall high school enrollment.

21 MS. JONES: Then, taking a look at the

1 number of exams taken in the past, we do see a
2 decline in the number of exams taken slightly
3 versus the prior year. Then, in terms of the
4 number of exams actually passed, that number is
5 up slightly to 642. One of the things we'll look
6 at momentarily is how that breaks out.

7 In terms of the comparison, in terms of
8 relating that pass rate and how we do versus the
9 state and nationally, you'll notice that while we
10 are up at the 28.9 percent which is showing here
11 as the largest percentage pass rate that we've
12 had over the last four years, we're still well
13 below what you'll notice for Maryland and the
14 nation. So again, alluding to the fact that
15 there is still work to be done here to make sure
16 that our students that are taking those exams are
17 able to actually pass them.

18 Previously we took a look at the number
19 of exams, now we're going to take a look at the
20 number of students. As we take a look at the
21 number of students, we find that number is down a

1 bit. So, that's the 1642 that you see noted on
2 the left side. In terms of the number of
3 students passing, that number is also down a bit
4 at 430.

5 Taking a look at PSAT, we have our
6 participation trends over time listed here. What
7 you'll notice here is that from 2010 to 2015, we
8 do see increases in both groups, sophomores and
9 juniors. However, you'll notice that we did have
10 a slight decline in terms of sophomores that were
11 participating in the PSAT last year to the tune
12 of 3,738 students taking it.

13 In terms of juniors, you'll notice that
14 there is quite a bit of an uptick on the
15 2014-2015 where we see a 6.6 percent increase
16 versus last year.

17 In terms of sophomore PSAT scores, now
18 we're going to take a look at breakdowns per
19 content area. Here we see that, for reading, we
20 have a decline. So, we're at 34.3 percent in
21 terms of the reading. In terms of math, we're

1 down slightly versus a year ago, but up versus
2 where we were in 2013 to the tune of 34.8. Then,
3 if we take a look at our scores for writing,
4 we're at 31.8. So, that's the lowest of those
5 three years. Again, these are just looking at
6 the actual scores.

7 Now taking a look at juniors, you'll
8 notice that juniors have declines across all
9 three content areas. So, reading, 36.3, math,
10 again down slightly versus prior year but up
11 versus where we were two years ago. Then, down
12 on the writing score to the tune of 34 points.

13 Now let's take a look at SAT results. In
14 terms of the number of SAT takers, as alluded to
15 before, some of these are a function of decreases
16 in enrollment. But, what you'll notice here is
17 that while there is a decrease in the number of
18 test takers, if you take a look at that in the
19 proportion of seniors taking SAT over the time
20 period, it's relatively flat representing
21 slightly shy of 65.7 percent.

1 Taking a look at SAT performance by
2 subject area, you'll see here we have some
3 increases with our seniors' performance.
4 Reading, you'll see an increase here of five
5 points versus prior year. So, that's 1.4
6 percent. Looking at our math, we're up 1.9
7 percent and, for writing, 1.4 percent.

8 In terms of looking at performance, one
9 of the things we've done here is to take a look
10 at performance by content area and by subgroup.
11 Particularly looking at our race and ethnicity
12 subgroups.

13 As it relates to critical reading, we do
14 see that we have an increase in our median SAT
15 scores among our black and white students. We
16 did see a decline with our Hispanic students.
17 You'll notice that the absolute number for
18 Hispanic students is still a very small
19 population at 79 students, as represented here.

20 As we take a look at math, though, we do
21 see increases across all three subgroups. So,

1 our black, Hispanic and white students, you'll
2 see increases here ranging from 0.8 percent for
3 Hispanic, up to 1.9 percent for our black
4 students.

5 In terms of writing, we saw a similar
6 path to what we saw for reading with black and
7 white students having increases and our Hispanic
8 students having a decrease.

9 As it relates to comparisons, one of the
10 things we've broken out here is a comparison
11 versus Maryland and the state. This takes a look
12 at the composite score looking at all three
13 components. So, you'll notice that we are up
14 slightly versus where we've been over the last
15 three years or so with 1143 as our total. But,
16 our total is still quite a bit below where
17 Maryland and the nation fall overall.

18 In terms of looking at college readiness
19 benchmarks, one of the things we were able to do
20 here is to take a look at how the College Board
21 defines college readiness which is looking at an

1 overall score of about 1,550 across the three
2 tests. So, with that, what you'll notice is that
3 our percentages are still low but we are seeing
4 gains versus prior year and across all of the
5 content areas. So, that's the plus two that is
6 represented here. So, critical reading, math,
7 writing and overall were up plus two versus the
8 prior time period.

9 As it relates to Maryland, Maryland is
10 seeing declines, you've probably read about this
11 in the paper, in terms of SAT performance
12 overall. That's also been part of the national
13 trend. Again, you'll see that while they are on
14 the decline, their numbers are still considerably
15 higher than city schools.

16 In terms of ACT results, as noted
17 previously, we do have an increased participation
18 in the ACT. Noted here is that we have 78 more
19 students that took the test. That takes us up to
20 357 participants in 2015. As we take a look at
21 their scores, their scores are actually

1 increasing across all subject areas. So, you'll
2 see those ranging here from 17 percent up to 18.3
3 percent as represented in reading.

4 In terms of the ACT definition of college
5 readiness and where we fall there, what you'll
6 notice here is in terms of those that have met
7 all four, English, math, science and reading, we
8 are up a point versus where we were in 2012.
9 We're up actually three points versus where we
10 were last year in meeting all four. Again, in
11 comparison with Maryland, we still have a way to
12 go. Maryland was also showing increases over the
13 same time period.

14 In terms of upcoming high school data, I
15 do want to point out that there are a lot of data
16 releases happening between now and the end of the
17 year, beginning of the year. So everyone is
18 aware, PARCC is happening. So, in terms of the
19 state's release of PARCC data, that data was
20 released today. As it relates to the district's
21 data, however, that data will not be available

1 until November.

2 So, what we're going to see is, for the
3 high school PARCC results, those will have an
4 embargo lift as of November 5th. So, we'll be
5 sharing information around those results at that
6 time. That will also be a part of us having a
7 conversation with the Teaching and Learning
8 Committee about all of these data points and how
9 they relate to the district's strategies and
10 efforts there.

11 In addition to that, we will have data
12 coming forward in terms of the Class of 2015, in
13 terms of the four-year data around that. We'll
14 also have our career and technology education
15 results coming out in the spring. So, that tends
16 to be the latest of this bundle that we receive
17 typically in the March window. But, we want to
18 make sure, as we're having conversations about
19 high schools, that we're not just focusing on the
20 college component, but we're also looking at
21 career readiness as represented by our

1 performance in career and technology education.

2 So, with that, we will open the floor to
3 see if there are questions. Certainly, I welcome
4 my colleagues from the Academic Office to share
5 perspective around the results we just shared.

6 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Any questions?

7 Commissioner Casciani?

8 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: Not a question,
9 just a comment. I mean, none of the rest of this
10 stuff matters if we can't increase the scores.
11 All the stuff we talk about, the plans, we have
12 to do a lot better.

13 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Commissioner

14 Hike-Hubbard.

15 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: I agree. I
16 appreciate the increase in test takers but we
17 still have to do a better job of getting our kids
18 to pass the tests. I see the segregation between
19 black, Hispanic and white students. I'd like
20 that further broken out by income as well. I'd
21 love to see if it's an income disparity issue or

1 if it's really a race issue. I think we should
2 keep plugging away.

3 I am also a little concerned about the
4 drop in enrollment. I'd like to talk about that
5 because it doesn't seem logical to me. So, I'd
6 love to have further conversation about that as
7 well.

8 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you very
9 much.

10 MS. JONES: Thank you.

11 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: That concludes our
12 information and discussion agenda. We've already
13 done the Consent Agenda and there were no items
14 removed from Consent. That leaves us with notice
15 of upcoming meetings.

16 The next meeting will be here, a public
17 session meeting, November 10th at 6:00 p.m.
18 Commissioner Casciani, when is the Operations
19 Committee meeting?

20 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: I believe
21 November 17th at 10:00 a.m. in this room.

1 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you.
2 Commissioner Hike-Hubbard, the next Teaching and
3 Learning Committee meeting?

4 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: The next
5 Teaching and Learning Committee meeting is
6 November 3rd at 3:30 here in this room. There's
7 also a Policy Committee meeting on November 11th
8 from 4:00 to 6:00 in this room.

9 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Thank you. Can I
10 have a motion to adjourn the meeting?

11 COMMISSIONER HIKE-HUBBARD: So moved.

12 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Commissioner
13 Hike-Hubbard. Can I have a second?

14 COMMISSIONER CASCIANI: Second.

15 BOARD CHAIR COOPER: Commissioner
16 Casciani. All those in favor? Vote is 6-0.
17 Thank you very much. Meeting is adjourned.

18 (PROCEEDINGS CONCLUDED AT 7:30 P.M.)

19

20

21

1 STATE OF MARYLAND

2 SS:

3 I, Dawn L. Brown, a Notary Public of the
4 State of Maryland, do hereby certify that the
5 foregoing transcript of a Baltimore City Board
6 of School Commissioners proceeding was
7 transcribed under my supervision as herein
8 appears and is an accurate transcript of what is
9 recorded and audible on the cassette.

10 I further certify that I am not of
11 counsel to any of the parties, nor an employee of
12 counsel, nor in any way interested in the outcome
13 of this action.

14 As witness my hand and notarial seal this
15 2nd day of November, 2015.

16

17

18

19

Notary Public

20

21 My commission expires September 21, 2018